

CONTENTS

	<i>page</i>
Introduction	XI
Abbreviations	XV
THE RIGHT TO FAMILY REUNIFICATION IN THE EU AND THE CASE-LAW IN ACCORDANCE THEREWITH	1
<i>Esther Gómez Campelo, Marina San Martín Calvo</i>	
FAMILY REUNIFICATION: LAYING THE FOUNDATIONS FOR THE FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS OF IMMIGRANTS TO FAMILY LIFE	1
1. The protection of family life in the European Convention on Human Rights and in the Charter of fundamental rights of the European Union	2
1.1. The protection of private and family life in the European Convention on Human Rights, in accordance with the principles recognized by Article 8 of the Convention	2
1.2. The respect for private and family life in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union	3
2. The Council Directive 2003/86/ec of 22 September 2003 on the right to family reunification	5
2.1. Purpose of the Council Directive	5
2.2. Subject matter of the Directive and compared application in the Member States	6
2.2.1. Family members to be reunified	6
2.2.2. Family members eligible for reunification	10
2.2.3. Requirements for reunification	11
2.2.4. Autonomous residence permit	15
2.2.5. Reasons for rejection	16
2.2.6. Right to Effective Judicial Protection	18
2.3. Conclusion of the Application of the Directive	18

	<i>page</i>
THE CJEU CASE-LAW IN THE RIGHT TO FAMILY REUNIFICATION	20
1. Introduction	20
2. Family Reunification of minors and refugees (Article 2 (F) in relation with Article 10 (3)(A) Directive)	21
2.1. Case C-550/16, A, S (2018)	21
3. Accreditation of stable and regular resources without recourse to the social assistance system of the Member State concerned (Article 7 (1)(C) Directive)	22
3.1. Case C-578/08 Rhimou Chakroun (2010)	22
3.2. Case C-558/14, Mimoun Khachab (2016)	23
3.3. Joined cases C-356/11 and C-357/11 O and S v Maahanmuuttovirasto and Maahanmuuttovirasto v L (2012)	24
4. Use of misleading information, false or falsified documents (Article 12(2)(A) Directive)	25
4.1. Case C-557/17, I.Z (2019)	25
5. Right to entry and residence for family members of citizens of Eu (Article 3(2)(A) of Directive 2004/38 8/EC of 29 April 2004 on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States and Directive 2008/86/EC)	26
5.1. Case C-83/11, Rahman and others (2012)	26
5.2. Case C-635/17, E. (2017)	27
6. Establishment by national law of the conditions relating to the granting and duration of the autonomous residence permit (Article 15 (4) Directive)	29
6.1. Case C- 484/17, K (2018)	29
6.2. Case C-257/17, C and A (2018)	30
6.3. Case 138/13, Naime Dogan (2014)	30
7. National law requiring the sponsor and his/her spouse to have reached the age of 21 by the date on which the application for family reunification is lodged (Article 4(5) Directive)	31
7.1. Case C-338/13, Marjan Noorzia (2014)	31
 THE RIGHT TO FAMILY REUNIFICATION UNDER SPANISH LAW AND THE CASE-LAW THEREOF	 35
<i>Esther Gómez Campelo, Marina San Martín Calvo</i>	
 FAMILY REUNIFICATION UNDER SPANISH LAW FOLLOWING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMUNITY LEGISLATION	 35
1. Introduction	35

	<i>page</i>
2. Family reunification in the spanish legal system	38
2.1. Conditions for the exercise of the right	39
2.2. Family members eligible for reunification	41
2.3. Required documents	44
2.4. Procedure	46
2.5. Renewal of residence permits	48
2.6. The access to work for joined family members	50
3. Family reunification under community law and its transposition into the spanish law	50
4. Comparing the directive with the spanish law	53
4.1. Conditions for the exercise of the right	53
4.2. Family members eligible for reunification	54
4.3. Procedural questions	56
4.4. Validity of temporary residence permits granted by family reunification	56
4.5. Individual retention of the right of residence of the joined persons	56
4.6. Right of access to employment	56
5. Administrative practice of family reunification: critical aspects	57
6. Conclusions	59

**THE SPANISH IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EUROPEAN CHARTER
ON HUMAN RIGHTS WITH REGARD TO FAMILY REUNIFICATION:
A CASE-LAW ANALYSIS**

	61
1. Introduction	61
2. The case-law of the Constitutional Court	65
3. The case-law of the Supreme Court	67
3.1. The case-law of the Supreme Court when the sponsor is a citizen of the EU	68
3.2. The case-law of the Supreme Court of Spain when the applicant is not a citizen of the EU	71
4. Conclusions	74

**THE FUNDAMENTAL RIGHT TO FAMILY REUNIFICATION IN THE
CONTEXT OF MIGRATION POLICIES THROUGH A MULTILEVEL
PERSPECTIVE** 79

Giulia Tiberi

1. Introduction: family reunification as a cornerstone in international and national policies on migration increasingly challenged in recent times by massive migration to Europe and Italy in particular 80
2. The right to family reunification for migrants as a “prism in 3D”: between “multiple dimension”, “variable geometry” and “constitutional variety” 83
3. The fundamental right to family reunification for foreign citizens in the Italian constitutional landscape 96
 - 3.1. The background – part I: fundamental rights and progressive equality of treatment for foreign citizens in the Italian legal order 96
 - 3.2. The background – part II: the constitutional right of asylum in the Italian legal order and the prominent role of the “humanitarian residence permit” as a “flexible instrument” for allowing entry into and stay within the country 102
 - 3.3. The right to family reunification for third country nationals under the Italian Constitution: between family unity and “issues of affection” 105
4. Contextualising the protection afforded to the right to family reunification within the Italian legislative provisions on immigration and asylum: the progressive restrictive trend 113
 - 4.1. The specific provisions regarding the right to family reunification in the “Consolidated Act on Immigration” transposing the Family Reunification Directive 2003/86/EC 114
5. “Elsewhere, in the meanwhile ...”: the protection afforded at the supranational level by the European Courts to the right to family reunification for foreign nationals and its growing influence in the Italian legal order 116
 - 5.1. The extended protection for the right to family reunification in the European Court of Human Rights’ case-law: recognizing family bonds in a wider perspective 117
 - 5.2. The EU Court of Justice’s case-law on the right to family reunification for third country nationals within the framework of the Family Reunification Directive in the light of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights 128
6. The scope of application for family reunification of third country nationals: clarifying the entitled persons (sponsor and beneficiaries) in the Italian legal order 131
 - 6.1. In search for clarification: which notion of “family” in the Italian constitutional landscape, relevant for the right to family reunification of Third-Country Nationals? 133

	<i>page</i>
6.1.1. From a traditional concept ...	135
6.1.2. ... To its gradual erosion under the influence of the European Courts case law	137
6.2. Reunification of Third-Country Nationals of same-sex partners: the final step made by the Italian legislator recognizing “union partnerships” open also to same-sex partnerships (Law no. 76/2016)	141
6.3. Family reunification and the prohibition of polygamy	143
7. Family reunification and children: assuring the best interests of the child	144
7.1. Adopted children: family reunification of minors under the Arabic scheme of “Kafalah”	148
8. Requirements for exercising the right to family reunification	150
9. The Italian procedure for family reunification: between legal requirements and practical problems	152
10. Rights granted to family members reunited	155
11. Reasons for rejection or denial of renewal	156
12. Family reunification rules for refugees and beneficiaries of subsidiary protection	157
13. Final remarks: the right to family reunification as a “laboratory” for the “composite” constitutional system of adjudication of fundamental rights among the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, the ECHR and national Constitutions?	159

THE RIGHT TO FAMILY REUNIFICATION IN THE BULGARIAN LEGAL ORDER

171

Sofia Razboynikova

1. Introduction	171
2. The right of asylum and international protection in the Bulgarian legal order: a brief overview	177
3. Integration of foreign citizens	179
4. Family reunification	181
5. Definition of sponsor and family members	183
5.1. Sponsor	183
5.2. Eligible family members	184
5.3. Spouse/stable long-term partner/same-sex partner	184
5.4. Minor children	186
5.5. Adult unmarried children	186
5.6. Parents of each of the spouses	186
6. The Bulgarian procedure and requirements for family reunification	187
6.1. Marriages of convenience	190

	<i>page</i>
7. Problems related to applications for international protection lodged by members of the same family (Article 22 LAR)	191
8. Unaccompanied minors	193
9. Impact of the ECtHR case-law on the legislation and case-law in Bulgaria	195
Conclusion	199